



On **Senator Ningi's**
Allegations and
Indiscriminate
Insertions in the
2024 Budget

1.0 Introduction

The President, Bola Ahmed Tinubu, submitted an appropriation bill of N27.50tn for the 2024 fiscal year before the National Assembly on November 29, 2023. The budget was reviewed and passed by the National Assembly and eventually signed into law by the President on January 1, 2024. A review of the 2024 Approved Budget shows that the National Assembly increased the Executive Budget proposal aggregately from N1.27tn to N28.78tn.

A more disaggregated look at the approved budget reveals that the National Assembly cut the recurrent non-debt budget proposal (personnel, overhead, pensions, gratuity, and other social benefits) by N1.15tn from the proposed N9.92tn to the approved sum of N8.77tn. Similarly, the National Assembly reduced the recurrent debt budget (debt servicing) by N220bn from N8.49tn proposed by the executive to N8.27tn. Conversely, the National Assembly raised the capital expenditure budget by N2.28tn from the proposed N7.72tn to N9.995tn. This means the National Assembly was willing to exercise its powers to introduce new projects or increase allocation for existing budgets to the tune of N2.28tn.

2.0 Allocations Excluded from the Budget Breakdown Published (Accounts for Senator Ningi's Allegation)

Senator Abdul Ningi alleged a padding of the 2024 budget to the tune of N3.7tn. However, our findings show that a budget breakdown totaling N25.4tn was provided for the budgets of the Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) and some other agencies receiving statutory allocation from the federal government. The comprehensive budget breakdown of government-owned enterprises, the National Assembly, the National Judicial Commission, the Public Complaints Commission, INEC, and TETFUND totaling N3.32tn was excluded from the budget that was passed and published. This does not mean the country operates two separate budgets and that there's only one final budget known to us.

However, the summary budget of the aforementioned agencies was passed by the National Assembly and included in the published approved budget. The practice of omitting the breakdown of certain government MDAs, the National Assembly, and the National Judicial Commission goes against one of the core principles of public budgeting which instructs that all expenditure breakdowns be presented in the same budget document. Although the FG published the proposed budget of GOEs, it is yet to publish the 2024 approved budgets for the GOEs.

A Captured in Budget Breakdown Published		
i	MDAs Budget	24,454,091,106,463
Statutory Transfers		
ii	Niger-Delta Development Comuission	338,924,732,832
iii	Universal Basic Education Commission	263,043,551,250
iv	National Human Rights Commission	5,000,000,000
v	North East Development Commission	131,836,332,912
viii	Basic Healthcare Provision Fund	131,521,775,625
viii	National Agency for Science and Engineering Infrastructure (NASENI)	131,521,775,625
Sub-Total (A)		25,455,939,274,707
B Excluded in the Budget Breakdown Published		
i	Government-Owned Enterprises Budget	1,880,526,179,249
ii	TETFUND	700,000,000,000
iii	National Judicial Council	341,625,739,236
iv	National Assembly	344,852,880,669
v	Public Complaints Commission	14,460,000,000
vii	Independent National Electoral Commission (INEC)	40,000,000,000
viii	Sub-Total (B)	3,321,464,799,154
Total Budget (A+B)		28,777,404,073,861

3.0 Distribution of Inserted Projects by Value

A total of 7,447 projects culminating in N2.24tn were inserted in the 2024 budget by the National Assembly, an ugly trend that was accelerated in the 9th National Assembly. Fifty-five of the projects range with a value of N580.7bn are greater than N5bn in value. We also noticed that 281 projects worth N491bn, and 3,706 projects within the range of N100–500m, worth 759bn were inserted into the budget. The National Assembly has indiscriminately added projects to the budget, with most projects having no national significance but narrowed to personal interests.

Breakdown of Insertions

Value Bands (Naira)	Frequency	Amount (Naira)	Share of Total Insertions
Greater than five billion	55	580.76 bn	25.94%
Greater than or equal to one billion but less than five billion	281	491.07 bn	21.93%
Greater than or equal to 500 million but less than one billion	464	282.30 bn	12.61%
Greater than or equal to 100 million but less than 500 million	3706	759.90 bn	33.94%
Greater than or equal to 50 million but less than 100 million	1458	87.32 bn	3.90%
Greater than or equal to ten million but less than 50 million	1437	37.42 bn	1.67%
Less than 10 million	46	268.6 m	0.01%
Total Value of Insertions	7447	2.24 tn	100.00%

4.0 Fragmentation of the Budget

A N100bn envelope was earmarked in the 2024 Executive Budget Proposal for lawmakers to nominate constituency/zonal intervention projects to cater to projects in their constituencies. However, the National Assembly members have gone beyond the N100bn envelope to insert thousands of constituency-like projects in the budgets of 326 MDAs that in most cases neither have the mandate nor technical capacity to implement and monitor the execution of the projects.

For example, 1,777 projects worth N218.6bn are to be directly delivered in federal constituencies while 1,308 projects with a value of n176bn are directly in senatorial districts. Other categories of projects include 1,150 streetlights worth N212bn, 427 boreholes worth N82.5bn, 170 ICT projects with a value of N30.95bn, and N7.61bn for empowerment of traditional rulers. If our analysis shows that 1,308 projects are to be implemented specifically in senatorial districts, it is not out of place that apart from the constituency projects, lawmakers also added up projects to their constituencies, at least N500m each.

Project Categorisation of Insertions

Nature of Insertions	Number of Insertions	Amount
Projects in Federal Constituencies	1,777	218.63 bn
Projects in Senatorial Districts	1,308	176.76 bn
Street lights	1,150	212.90 bn
Boreholes	427	82.50 bn
ICT-related Projects	170	30.96 bn
Construction/renovation of Community Town Halls	58	11.32 bn
Education related projects (Construction of classroom blocks, provision of exercise books, training of teachers etc)	767	186.78 bn
Health related projects	503	89.63 bn
Empowerment of Traditional Rulers	16	7.62 bn
Road Construction/Rehabilitation	898	460.16 bn
Purchase of security vehicle	9	2.04 bn

5.0 Categorization of Insertions by Supervising Ministries

Thirty-three percent of the projects worth N632bn were inserted in the Ministry of Agriculture's budget, raising its capital budget from N332bn to N963bn. Recall that in a previous analysis done by BudgIT on the 2021 and 2022 Budget of the federal government, it was revealed that the National Assembly inserted 1,125 and 1,522 projects respectively in the 2021 and 2022 budgets of the Federal Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (including quite several MDAs under it). In other Ministries such as Science and Technology, 757 new projects worth N207bn were added and 263 projects with a value of N242bn were inserted by the National Assembly.

Top Ministries with Insertions

Mother Ministry	Frequency	Amount
Federal Ministry of Agriculture And Food Security	2470	632.31 bn
Federal Ministry of Works	263	242.19 bn
Federal Ministry of Science Technology And Innovation	757	207.39 bn
Federal Ministry of Education	522	150.57 bn
Federal Ministry of Water Resources	494	146.43 bn
Federal Ministry of Budget And Economic Planning	83	145.74 bn
Federal Ministry of Health And Social Welfare	435	105.00 bn
Federal Ministry of Labour And Employment	532	79.91 bn
Federal Ministry of Power	140	74.40 bn
Secretary to the Government of the Federation	537	62.68 bn
Federal Ministry of Industry Trade and Investment	238	62.45 bn

Federal Ministry of Humanitarian Affairs and Poverty Alleviation	212	61.27 bn
Federal Ministry of Housing and Urban Development	98	49.85 bn
Federal Ministry of Policy Affairs	14	29.91 bn
Federal Ministry of Transport	59	29.34 bn
Presidency	77	21.64 bn

6.0 Insertions by Ministries, Agencies and Departments

It is very evident that certain agencies and organizations are targeted by the National Assembly members. For example, the NIGERIAN BUILDING AND ROAD RESEARCH INSTITUTE, LAGOS, and FEDERAL CO-OPERATIVE COLLEGE, OJI RIVER, among others, have become the targets for National Assembly members to insert projects. Most of these agencies don't have the required technical capacity to execute the delegated projects, leaving a long list of poorly executed projects across the country.

MDA	Frequency	Amount
Federal Ministry of Works	178	222.86 bn
Federal Ministry of Agriculture and Food Security - HQTRS	174	130.02 bn
Nigerian Building and Road Research Institute - Lagos	267	110.18 bn
Federal Co-Operative College- Oji River	419	90.81 bn
National Rural Electrification Agency	116	70.58 bn
National Productivity Centre	397	63.50 bn
Smedan - H/QTRS	213	57.88 bn

Border Communities Development Agency (BCDA) HQTRS	446	51.09 bn
National Senior Secondary Education Commission (NSSEC)	15	49.80 bn
Sokoto Rima RBDA	73	48.95 bn
Federal Ministry of Housing And Urban Development - HQTRS	84	47.88 bn
Nigeria Institute of Oceanography and Marine Research	161	46.64 bn
Federal Co-Operative College- Ibadan	182	45.36 bn
Federal College of Horticulture, Dadin-Kowa, Gombe	248	42.39 bn
Federal College of Fisheries and Marine Technology - Lagos	160	40.22 bn

7.0 Frivolous Items/Out of the Mandate of MDAs

Many agencies are executing projects that are out of scope and frivolous, thereby adding zero value to the country. Most of the projects are tied to the political value of the lawmakers and are indiscriminately added to the budgets of several MDAs. How will these agencies, without the requisite knowledge regarding these projects, properly monitor and appraise performance? A few allocations are provided below:

National Centre for Agricultural Mechanisation, Ilorin

Code	Expenditure	Amount
ERGP297481232	Provision of Security Patrol Vehicles in Lagos	500,000,000
ERGP20247639	Support for Language Studies & Art in Bayelsa West Senatorial District	50,000,000
ERGP20245033	Support for Traditional Rulers and Chiefs	40,000,000
ERGP20245613	Special ICT Training for Youth and Graduate for Professional Certification in Selected Location of Ilisan/ Irolu, Asa/Yobo & Idi Iyin Community	200,000,000
ERGP20245614	Special ICT Training for Youth and Graduate for Professional Certification in Selected Location of Ogere, Agbowa & Otapele Community	200,000,000
ERGP20245615	Special ICT Training for Youth and Graduate for Professional Certification in Selected Location of Isokan/ Oyebajo, Iseri & Oke Agbede Community	200,000,000
ERGP20243744	Rehabilitation of Primary Schools and Health Centres in Ondo Central Senatorial District	58,000,000
ERGP20246507	Provision of Community Based Health Insurance and Support for Free Maternal & Infant Reduction Programme in Bayelsa West Senatorial District	200,000,000
ERGP20246809	Construction and Renovation of Hospitals and Health Centre in Bayelsa West Senatorial District	100,000,000
ERGP20241432	Provision and Installation of Solar Streetlights in Communities, Adamawa State	120,000,000
ERGP20241433	Provision of Solar Streetlights in Various Locations in (Amakpu-Amata-Ubegu Ihie), Ebonyi State	10,000,000

Code	Expenditure	Amount
ERGP202418357	Provision And Installation of Solar Streetlights in Gummi/ Bukkuyum Fed. Constituency Zamfara State Mbalitoli/Ikedur Fed. Constituency Imo State Ekiti/Isiu/Irepodin Oker/Ero Fed. Constituency, Kwara State Bakori/Danja Fed. Constituency, Katsina State Miga/Jahun Fed. Constituency, Jigawa State Ogbia Fed. Constituency, Bayelsa State Sumaila/Takai Fed. Constituency, Kano State Bindawa/Mani Fed. Constituency, Katsina State Oshodi-Isolo I Fed. Constituency, Lagos State Minjibir/Ungoggo Fed. Constituency, Kano State Michika/ Madagali Fed. Constituency, Adamawa State Shinkafi/Zurmi Fed. Constituency Zamfara State	1,200,000,000

Federal Cooperative College, Oji River

Code	Project Name	Type	Amount
ERGP5211990	Construction of Rural Farm Roads in Essien & Etim Ekpo Of Akwa Ibom North West Senatorial District @ N500m Per LGA	New	1,000,000,000
ERGP5211991	Construction of Rural Farm Roads in Ika & Ikot Epene Of Akwa Ibom North West Senatorial District @ N500m Per LGA	Ongoing	1,000,000,000
ERGP5212001	Rehabilitation of Selected Roads and Installation of New Transformers And Cables in Different Towns in Ika & Ikot Epene Local Government of North West Senatorial District of Akwa Ibom	New	1,000,000,000
ERGP5212005	"Construction of Ikot Uko Road and Ikot Ebak @500m each to aid Movement of Fishers Produce in Akwa Ibom State"	New	1,000,000,000
ERGP20246148	Provision of Town Hall for Community Integration in Various Selected Locations Across Nigeria (Batch 1 & 2)	Ongoing	1,000,000,000
ERGP20246149	Construction of Townhall in Selected Communities in South West	Ongoing	1,000,000,000
ERGP20245884	Construction of 8 nos. 6 Classroom Blocks in Obanliku LGA With Vip Toilets and Staff Office		800,000,000

Code	Project Name	Type	Amount
ERGP20246081	Construction of All-In-One Solar Street Lights To Illuminate Parts of Onitsha, Ihiala, Alor, Enugwu-Ukwu, Enugwu-Agidi, Ezi Owelle, Nnewi And Ogboji Parts of Anambra State @100m Per Location	New	800,000,000
ERGP20245558	Provision of Motorcycles and Tricycles to Some Youths in Ogun ,Lagos,Ondo,Osun,Ekiti And Oyo States	New	500,000,000
ERGP20247242	Changing of Obsolete Transformers with Fencing Round the Transformer to Enhance Preservation of Agricultural Produce in Osun West Senatorial District	New	300,000,000
ERGP20245922	Completion of Anglican Church Hall in Arochukwu LGA, Abia North Senatorial District, Abia State	Ongoing	150,000,000

8.0 Recommendations

Judicial Interpretation: The Judiciary, though ordinarily not part of the budgetary process, can make a significant impact, specifically in Nigeria's case. For some time now, there has been uncertainty about whether or not the National Assembly, by constitutional provisions of powers of appropriation, oversight, and review, has powers to insert new projects (line items) into the budget proposal without recourse to the Executive. There needs to be a final judicial pronouncement on the scope of the powers of appropriation granted to the National Assembly in the constitution, especially as it regards the authority to arbitrarily insert new capital projects in the annual budget.

Proposed Political Solution: While we wait for the judicial interpretation of the appropriation powers granted to the National Assembly, it is expedient that until the Supreme Court makes the pronouncement, the interest of the National Assembly is captured during the budget preparation process. This will, to a large extent, limit the distortions caused by the National Assembly's arbitrary insertions and limit the instances of projects assigned to MDAs with neither the mandate nor capacity to implement. One hundred billion was previously set aside for the National Assembly constituency projects and it might be right for the Executive and the Legislature to agree on a percentage of capital projects that can be inserted as new projects in the budget, especially at the constituency or district level.

Non-Execution of Projects Outside MDA Scope: It is important that the Nigerian President, who is the custodian of fiscal policy, has a tight grip on the National Budget. He needs to sanction an Executive Order to bar agencies from accepting projects outside their mandate. Most agencies do not have the requisite capacity to deliver the projects efficiently, thereby contributing to waste and public resource abuse.

Implement Strong Deterrents for Corruption and Foul Play: The EFCC and ICPC need to prosecute cases of abuse, corruption, and financial recklessness associated with the budget process. As stated earlier in the text, the ICPC had identified instances of corruption in 2021 and 2022, however, there are yet to be prosecutions for such cases, which are supposed to serve as deterrents for future occurrences.

Make Citizens and Civil Society an Indispensable Part of the Budgeting Process and Attend to Their Questions and Comments: Using subnational units that have achieved some measure of inclusion with ‘Citizen’s Budget Hearings’ as example, BudgIT is of the view that such participation is necessary. Citizens and Civil Society deserve to be carried along in the Approval Stage, as their question on the Appropriation Bill (and clarification of the reason for the budget insertions by the National Assembly) may prevent the insertions from happening in the first place. This inclusion must be timely and designed in a way that citizens and civil society’s inputs are taken into consideration and considered in the National Assembly’s decision-making.

Make Long-term Planning a Deliberate and Truly National Affair: The budget needs to be seen as a planning tool and be diligently prepared as such, not as a spending manual as presently constituted. All of the projects and programs articulated in the budget need to align with the Medium Term Expenditure Framework and the National Medium Term Development Plan. All arms and levels of government need to work cohesively together to ensure the budget not only aligns with the developmental aspirations of the country but also reflects the needs and preferences of the general populace. This means that the Executive, Legislature, Federal, State, and Local governments must be a part of the planning process. This would ensure concerns from all arms and levels percolate to the top and the various components of government find a voice for their own needs.

Appendix

	Recurrent Non-Debt			Recurrent Debt (Debt Service)			Capital			Total		
	Proposed	Approved	Variance	Proposed	Approved	Variance	Proposed	Approved	Variance	Proposed	Approved	Variance
Statutory Transfers	1.38tn	1.74tn	366.43bn	.00tn	.00tn	.00bn	.00tn	.00tn	.00tn	1.38tn	1.74tn	366.43bn
MDAs	7.97tn	7.67tn	-299.73bn	8.49tn	8.27tn	-220.00bn	6.23tn	8.51tn	2.28tn	22.70tn	24.45tn	1.76tn
GOEs	1.91tn	1.06tn	-850.00bn	.00tn	.00tn	.00bn	820.91bn	820.91bn	.00tn	2.73tn	1.88tn	-850.00bn
TETFUND	35.00bn	35.00bn	.00bn	.00bn	.00bn	.00bn	665.00bn	665.00bn	.00bn	700.00bn	700.00bn	.00bn
Total	9.92tn	8.77tn	-1.15tn	8.49tn	8.27tn	-220.00bn	7.72tn	10.00tn	2.28tn	27.50tn	28.78tn	1.27tn



budgfi

